

Historic Preservation Commission
Wednesday, December 20, 2006
6:00 p.m. Village Hall

Commission Members present: K. DeLaney, Chair, A. , B. Ess, W. Stone. Trustee B. Slick, liaison

Commission Members excused: S. Dyson, K. Waterman Kulpa

Observers: David Sutton, architect for the petitioner

Julia Bogacki, petitioner

Mary Lowther, Mayor of Williamsville, Historical Society President

Sally Kuzon, Village of Williamsville Administrator

K. DeLaney called the meeting to order at 6:06 p.m. It was noted that a mid-afternoon e-mail message from S. Dyson indicated he would be unable to attend due to a family illness. B. Slick phoned K. Waterman-Kulpa to see if she was on her way to the meeting, and was unable to get a response. Since there are only 6 members on the committee, it was determined that a quorum was present and the Commission could proceed.

David Sutton introduced himself as the architect for the petitioner, Julia Bognacki, in the matter property at 72 S. Cayuga Road, where a detached two-car garage is proposed for construction. It is one-story 23'-0" by 24'-0" and is to be sited on the northeast portion of the property entrance, behind the building—an historic structure designated by the Village of Williamsville.

Mr. Sutton noted that the proposed garage is intended to be respectful of the existing structure. It will be a modest two-car garage using modern materials, including vinyl siding, architectural roof shingles, and be of a character with features that will complement, rather than mimic, the existing structure... "an accessory."

The owner, Ms. Bognacki, uses the original structure as a residence, and is petitioning for the garage as a practical matter, finding suitable storage difficult. The garage has been thoughtfully planned for several years, and it is the hope of the architect and the petitioner that the drawings submitted for this meeting will create conversation. Ms. Bognacki is ready to oblige, without creating financial hardship.

B. Ess asked what kind of siding would be used? He noted that there is an addition on the back of the historic property. Mr. Sutton said that as far as could be determined the addition on the back of the property was added in the 1950s, and is asbestos shingles. It is not a suitable storage area. It is the intent of the property owner to use Dutch lap siding, and architectural roofing shingles on the new structure.

B. Ess also asked about the position of the garage and if the siting would have present problems, or conflict with the historic structure. Mr. Sutton noted that the garage would be at the rear of the building, and that because the land drops a substantial portion, the siting was carefully considered. W. Stone concurred having surveyed the property.

W. Stone asked if any trees would need to be removed to support the new structure. Mr. Sutton said no. Trees visible from the road are very close to the property line, and seem to be the neighbors. There was not any real damage to the trees from the October 12 snow and ice storm; and consequently, there hasn't been any removal of trees for construction, nor is it proposed.

Arvela spoke as a long-standing member of the Commission, stating that she was grateful to Ms. Bognacki that she had followed all the principles of the historic designation, was respectful with maintenance, upkeep and repair of the structure and site. She felt that the original stone quality, historically significant windows and importance of character features would be represented in the garage.

Wes said he was "not liking" the trim features, and asked if they could be changed, altered or eliminated. He would like to see a mimic of the flat stone pediment without the keystone (on the façade of the garage), similar to the façade of the house.

D. Sutton said that they would be limited to 16 ft. to the ridge of house, and that the roof pitch would be identical. Wes asked about introduction of a roof feature, and D. Sutton said that no exposed wood board detail would be seen.

Arvela wants to ensure that the garage is separate and distinct, but not "landed from another generation." D. Sutton said that the vinyl siding (a Dutch lap substance) captures a shadowed effect. It is simulated texture, and would be double 8-4 on profile with 6" siding.

Wes said he'd like to see carriage doors as a garage door option. Trustee Liason Slick said she had recently installed a garage door, and offered to show a photo of one she located similar to carriage designs we were discussing. All agreed that the representation would enhance the garage, and retain the character of the federal-style more than the rendered drawing.

Arvela asked about the slope of the land and how the garage would be stabilized. D. Sutton said that it would be a sloped slab, flat with a grade. The back of the building may drop 2-3 ft., no regrading would occur, but it would be flush with the grade at the front of the structure, and pitched at back.

Wes suggested that a louvered vent be used instead of the featured element. And that instead of the rendered lamp, a garage-style goose neck light placed higher on the façade and on a motion detector, would be more in character with the property.

D. Sutton said that they would really like to keep the set-back on the façade, and all agreed that it is a positive feature that would be further enhanced by carriage-style doors.

B. Ess asked about the color of the structure. D. Sutton said that it would be "putty" simulating slate-grey-black tone of the main structure. Trim would be white to complement the existing structure.

Ms. Bognacki said that she was anxious to have the structure, and felt that the requests made by the Commission were in keeping with what she wants.

Arvela motioned that a resolution be made since the Commission has no objection to the project to construct the garage. All were in favour.

Resolved to support the project of a garage to be constructed at 72 S. Cayuga with modifications more in keeping with the Federal-style of the original structure. Those conditions being: to straighten the lintel to be similar to the one above the existing structure's façade; eliminate façade vent; replace lighting with a decorative carriage light, possibly with a goose neck feature; to keep the two-foot step back, and the window and door on the side of the garage. The color is to complement the original building in the charcoal grey family for the architectural roofing and the putty grey for the Dutch lap siding.

The motion is to be supported with resubmittal of drawings.

Wes seconded motion.

All approved by show of hand.

D. Sutton indicated he could have samples within two days, and Commission will sign off on exact changes prior to Certificate of Appropriateness deadline.

Motion to adjourn meeting by Wes Stone at 6:56. Seconded by Arvela Heider.

Meeting adjourned.

Respectfully submitted,

Kathleen DeLaney

Chair

12/22/06