

**Historic Preservation Commission**  
**April 18, 2013**

Meeting called to order at 7:05pm.

**Attendance:** Penny Armitage, J.J. Duval, Stephen Dyson, Wes Stone, and Kate Waterman-Kulpa and Trustee Basil Piazza.

**Excused:** Anthony Bannon

**Minutes:** Motion to approve meeting minutes from the 2.7.13 meeting by Stephen Dyson. Second by Penny Armitage. Unanimously approved.

**New Business:**

**5409 Main Street**

Upon referral from the Architectural and Planning Review Board, Dave Sutton of Sutton Architecture presented a proposal for an addition to his property at 5409 Main Street. The building is not a local landmark, but it is one of the properties listed in the (current CLG Grant funded) Intensive Level Survey of Historic Resources. The Architectural and Planning Review Board asked the HPC to advise on the appropriateness of the applicant's proposal as it pertains to the historic building.

**Proposal:** The proposed addition would be on the south side (Main Street) of the 1877 Italianate Revival. Mr. Sutton explained the concept for the addition is being a transparent box which will allow the historic building to be seen, especially at night when lit from the interior. The addition was designed to meet the Village's new design standards. The addition would come right to the sidewalk. It would feature a setback entrance door, to allow access to the barber shop next door. The one-story addition would house three-season restaurant seating and roof top seating patio. The upper patio would have a black metal railing. The existing porch would be squared off at the NW corner to allow for addition seating. The roof of the porch would be removed to allow for a stairway to the second floor seating area. Second floor access would be through the building. The addition would have dark gray paneled effect very similar to the Williamsville business – Coffee Culture. The panels would be “knee wall” height with aluminum framed operable window wall system above it. Another horizontal sign panel with cornice will top the windows. Mr. Sutton said the building, including the porch is in need of restoration. Although, reconstructed in the mid 1990's, the wood porch has some rot and the original brick building is in need of repointing of the brick.

**Discussion:** Railing on the second floor is a major concern for some of the HPC members. Different railing materials were discussed. It was determined that the railing material was not the major concern, but the fact that the railing hides the second floor Italianate architecture features.

At the pedestrian scale, the addition hides the entire Italianate building.

The Commission discussed a one story addition on the Main Street façade and thought it created an imbalance of the original building and proposed addition. The building is a very simple example of the Italianate style.

The front porch is a reconstruction of the original porch. Dave Sutton was the Architect who researched and designed the existing porch from historic photos (two photos -1. undated, but believed to be from the very early 1900's, and 2. dated photo of the Main Street façade from 1956 found on Ed Young's website.) The porch is one of the major style characteristics of the building. (And it was important enough to be reconstructed.) It was noted that the entire addition seems to overpower the historic character of the original building. Some members of the Commission described the addition design as "heavy," whereas the front porch is a very "delicate." "Porches should be supplementary to the building, not vice versa."

Discussion was had regarding the existing front and the design of the addition door and sidelights. The new door does not proportionally fit with the proportion of glass on the addition.

**Recommendation:** The Commission places a higher value on the historic Main Street façade. Although the other facades of this building have historic value and style characteristics, the Commission recommends the Owner design a one-story addition on the west façade of the building behind the "bump out" (the building is small "t" shaped) where the former side porch has not been reconstructed, at the location of the current handicapped parking spaces.

The Commission would very much like to work with the Owner to expand the restaurant presence on Main Street. The combination of the current outdoor seating arrangement and a new one-story addition on the west facade could achieve the Owner's desired outcome for year round dining and outdoor Main Street dining.

This Commission places extreme value on this site due to its state of being an intact example of a historic building on Main Street.

**Old Business:**

**CLG Grant**

Clinton Brown Company Architecture is currently performing the research required for the Intensive Level Survey of Historic Resources in the Village. Five of the completed Historic Resource Inventory Forms were previously circulated among the Commission members for review and comment.

Also, the additional five properties to be added to the Survey work were determined. They are as follows: 1. 5570 Main Street – Old Fire Station, 2. Garrison Park- suspected site of War of 1812 army hospital, 3. South Long Park - 40 South Long Street, (includes Village DPW parcel) and 135 Milton Street, 4. Island Park - 5577 Main Street, and 5. Ely-Zent House 56 Spring St.

### **New Grants**

The purpose of the request for funds will be to assist in the funding for the local landmark designation process after the Intensive Level Survey of Historic Resources is complete.

Two motions were made...

“Resolution to recommend to the Village Board to submit a 2013 PreserveNY Grant from Preservation League of New York State due May 1, 2013” by Kate Waterman-Kulpa. Second by Wes Stone. Unanimously approved.

“Resolution to recommend to the Village Board to submit a 2013 CLG Grant from Preservation League of New York State for FY2012 funds” by Kate Waterman-Kulpa. Second by Steve Dyson. Unanimously approved.

### **New HPC Member Packets**

As the longest serving member, Wes Stone has volunteered to compile a packet of important information to give to all HPC members. The group brainstormed and came up with a list of documents (which Wes will add to if necessary.) The list includes: the 1996 Bero prepared Reconnaissance Survey, a current Local Landmark list, the Historic Preservation section of the Village Code, the current Local Landmark’s documentation for making them Local Landmarks, Historic Society’s walking tour pamphlet, and (when available) the CBCA prepared Intensive Level Survey of Historic Resources.

### **Next Meeting Date**

Next meeting will be May 16, 2013 at 7pm.

Motion to adjourn the meeting at 9:31pm by Wes Stone. Steve Dyson seconded the motion. Unanimously approved.

Submitted by Kate Waterman-Kulpa